

# EXHIBIT 4

**From:** Prelogar, Brandon B [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 19, 2017 6:00 PM  
**To:** Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy [REDACTED]; Anderson, Kathryn E [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Levine, Laurence D [REDACTED]; Porto, Victoria [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Updated Central American TPS Decision Memos  
**Attach:** D1-S1 Decision memo El Salvador 10-19-17.doc; D1-S1 Decision memo Hondruas 10-19-17.doc; D1-S1 Decision memo Nicaragua 10-19-17.doc; 171019 Central America TPS Addendum - v.5.docx

---

Attaching updated CA TPS memos (in redline) with the changes requested below. Also attaching RU's country conditions addendum, which they worked up on the fly today to get us the stats on employment and tourism.

---

**From:** Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 19, 2017 12:46 AM  
**To:** Prelogar, Brandon B; Anderson, Kathryn E  
**Cc:** Levine, Laurence D; Porto, Victoria  
**Subject:** RE: Updated Central American TPS Decision Memos

Hi, guys.

I didn't get to these today or tonight....and I'm gone tomorrow. So, I am hoping you can help edit to accommodate suggestions from Craig.

Change "disasters" throughout to "challenges".

What about unemployment rates in each country? Can you add?

What about tourism for each country?

In option 4 strike the part about environmental disasters to read as:  
While one could argue that widespread violence warrant a new TPS designation, it is not advised.

Thank you!

**Kathy Nuebel Kovarik**  
Chief, Office of Policy and Strategy  
U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services  
Direct: [REDACTED]  
Cell: [REDACTED]

---

**From:** Prelogar, Brandon B  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 17, 2017 2:07 PM  
**To:** Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Anderson, Kathryn E  
**Cc:** Levine, Laurence D; Porto, Victoria  
**Subject:** RE: Updated Central American TPS Decision Memos

Kathy,

Here are the cleaned up CA TPS decision memos. Attaching also the FRNs both those extending the designations for

the first time and the ones we drew language from that explained why the first designations were made. They're each labeled "Initial Designation" or "First Extension" accordingly.

---

**From:** Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 17, 2017 12:07 AM  
**To:** Anderson, Kathryn E; Prelogar, Brandon B  
**Cc:** Levine, Laurence D; Porto, Victoria  
**Subject:** RE: Updated Central American TPS Decision Memos

Thank you. I don't have edits. Although the Director did ask me to get copies of the fed register notices that extended it for the first time after its original designation. If you can pull those, that would be helpful.

Can you also clean up, accept edits, and resend to me, please? I want to get these up to OCC/FO tomorrow. Really appreciate it.

**Kathy Nuebel Kovarik**  
Chief, Office of Policy and Strategy  
U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services  
Direct: [REDACTED]  
Cell: [REDACTED]

---

**From:** Anderson, Kathryn E  
**Sent:** Monday, October 16, 2017 6:00 PM  
**To:** Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Prelogar, Brandon B  
**Cc:** Levine, Laurence D; Porto, Victoria  
**Subject:** RE: Updated Central American TPS Decision Memos

Kathy, here are the three memos. We made a few edits to what you sent for Honduras and Nicaragua and then made edits to El Salvador to accord with the ones made to the other two memos. Let us know if these fit the bill or you need anything further!

---

**From:** Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy  
**Sent:** Sunday, October 15, 2017 11:22 PM  
**To:** Prelogar, Brandon B  
**Cc:** Anderson, Kathryn E; Levine, Laurence D; Porto, Victoria  
**Subject:** RE: Updated Central American TPS Decision Memos

Hey there given our briefing with AS1, we need to revise the memos. We need to better explain why they were originally designated TPS, so I pulled some info from the Federal Register. We also need to eliminate all mention of DED since that's not her option and really not a legally defensible one. I have only done Nicaragua and Honduras, and am hoping you can review them and then attempt to do El Sal, too. Thanks in advance for your help!

**Kathy Nuebel Kovarik**  
Chief, Office of Policy and Strategy  
U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services  
Direct: [REDACTED]  
Cell: [REDACTED]

---

**From:** Prelogar, Brandon B  
**Sent:** Friday, October 13, 2017 12:06 PM  
**To:** McCament, James W  
**Cc:** Nuebel Kovarik, Kathy; Anderson, Kathryn E; Levine, Laurence D; Porto, Victoria  
**Subject:** Updated Central American TPS Decision Memos

James,

Kathy asked us to shoot these updated CA TPS memos your way on her behalf (see attached in redline and clean). Kathryn and I are available to discuss or assist with any further requested edits as needed.

b-

Brandon Prelogar  
Chief, International and Humanitarian Affairs Division  
Department of Homeland Security/U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services  
Office of Policy and Strategy

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]



**TPS Addendum – Central America**

Last Updated: October 19, 2017

**El Salvador**

According to the World Bank, El Salvador “continues to suffer from persistent low levels of growth, which between 2010 and 2016 only averaged 1.9%.”<sup>1</sup> Urban poverty has increased in recent years, while the country’s fiscal situation has “progressively deteriorated.”<sup>2</sup> High levels of crime and violence threaten economic growth by increasing the cost of doing business, negatively impacting investment decisions, and limiting job creation.<sup>3</sup> The Salvadoran government has estimated that the country’s unemployment rate was 7% in 2014, 2015, and 2016.<sup>4</sup> Underemployment is high, estimated at 31% in 2014 and 34.9% in 2015.<sup>5</sup>

In its most recent travel warning, the U.S. Department of State warned U.S. citizens to “carefully consider the risks of travel to El Salvador due to the high rates of crime and violence. El Salvador has one of the highest homicide levels in the world and crimes such as extortion, assault and robbery are common.”<sup>6</sup> In a 2017 report, the World Economic Forum ranked El Salvador 105<sup>th</sup> out of 136 countries in its travel and tourism competitiveness index, including 134<sup>th</sup> in regards to safety and security.<sup>7</sup> In 2015, El Salvador ranked 91<sup>st</sup> out of 141 countries in the overall rankings.<sup>8</sup>

**Honduras**

According to the World Bank, “Since the 2008-2009 global economic crisis, Honduras has experienced a moderate recovery, driven by public investments, exports and higher remittances.”<sup>9</sup> However, the country still faces “major challenges,” including high levels of poverty and inequality, vulnerability to external shocks and adverse natural events, and “rampant crime and violence.”<sup>10</sup> The Honduran government estimated that the country’s unemployment rate was 7.4% in 2016.<sup>11</sup> Underemployment is a

<sup>1</sup> El Salvador Overview, The World Bank, Oct. 10, 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/elsalvador/overview> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>2</sup> El Salvador Overview, The World Bank, Oct. 10, 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/elsalvador/overview> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>3</sup> El Salvador Overview, The World Bank, Oct. 10, 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/elsalvador/overview> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>4</sup> MINEC y DIGESTYC presentan principales resultados de la EHPM 2016, Dirección General de Estadísticas y Censos (DIGESTYC), <http://www.digestyc.gob.sv/index.php/novedades/noticias/767-ministerio-de-economia-y-digestyc-presentan-principales-resultados-de-la-encuesta-de-hogares-de-propositos-multiples-2016.html> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017); Alemán, Uveli, Más de 2,000 ingresan a las filas del desempleo y crece el trabajo precario, El Mundo (El Sal.), Oct. 20, 2016.

<sup>5</sup> Alemán, Uveli, Más de 2,000 ingresan a las filas del desempleo y crece el trabajo precario, El Mundo (El Sal.), Oct. 20, 2016; The World Factbook – El Salvador, Central Intelligence Agency, Oct. 10, 2017, <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/es.html> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>6</sup> El Salvador Travel Warning, U.S. Department of State, Feb. 14, 2017, <https://travel.state.gov/content/passports/en/alertswarnings/el-salvador-travel-warning.html> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>7</sup> The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2017, World Economic Forum, 2017.

<sup>8</sup> The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2017, World Economic Forum, 2017.

<sup>9</sup> Honduras Overview, The World Bank, Oct. 10, 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/honduras/overview> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>10</sup> Honduras Overview, The World Bank, Oct. 10, 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/honduras/overview> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>11</sup> Desocupados 2016, INE Honduras, [http://www.ine.gob.hn/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=94](http://www.ine.gob.hn/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=94) (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

significant problem, with some estimates indicating that over 50% of the population may be underemployed.<sup>12</sup>

In its most recent travel warning, the U.S. Department of State warned U.S. citizens to “remain alert at all times when traveling in Honduras”—a country it described as having “one of the highest murder rates in the world,” and where criminals are able to operate “with a high degree of impunity.”<sup>13</sup> In a 2017 report, the World Economic Forum ranked Honduras 90<sup>th</sup> out of 136 countries in its travel and tourism competitiveness index, including 128<sup>th</sup> in regards to safety and security.<sup>14</sup> In 2015, Honduras ranked 90<sup>th</sup> out of 141 countries in the overall rankings.<sup>15</sup>

## Nicaragua

According to the World Bank, Nicaragua “has stood out for maintaining growth levels above the average for Latin America and the Caribbean” in recent years.<sup>16</sup> Although poverty declined from 2009 to 2014, it nevertheless “remains high,” and Nicaragua is “still one of Latin America’s least developed countries, where access to basic services is a daily challenge.”<sup>17</sup> In August 2017, the Nicaraguan government reported that 96% of the population was employed, and 42.6% of the population was underemployed as of the first quarter of 2017.<sup>18</sup> A Nicaraguan news outlet claimed that these statistics could not be verified because the Nicaraguan government had not published the underlying quarterly data on unemployment since the end of 2012.<sup>19</sup>

The U.S. Department of State does not currently have an active travel alert or travel warning for Nicaragua.<sup>20</sup> In a 2017 report, the World Economic Forum ranked Nicaragua 92<sup>nd</sup> out of 136 countries in its travel and tourism competitiveness index, including 65<sup>th</sup> in regards to safety and security.<sup>21</sup> In 2015, Nicaragua ranked 92<sup>nd</sup> out of 141 countries in the overall rankings.<sup>22</sup>

<sup>12</sup> Torres, Damaris, CCIT: La tasa de subempleo en Honduras es de 50%, RadioHRN (Hon.), Nov. 24, 2016; Aguilar, Victoria, CCIT: Tasa de subempleo en Honduras ya supera el 50%, Tiempo Digital (Hon.), Nov. 24, 2016.

<sup>13</sup> Honduras Travel Warning, U.S. Department of State, Jan. 23, 2017, <https://travel.state.gov/content/passports/en/alertswarnings/honduras-travel-warning.html> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>14</sup> The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2017, World Economic Forum, 2017.

<sup>15</sup> The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2017, World Economic Forum, 2017.

<sup>16</sup> Nicaragua Overview, The World Bank, Oct. 10, 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/nicaragua/overview> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>17</sup> Nicaragua Overview, The World Bank, Oct. 10, 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/nicaragua/overview> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>18</sup> Alvarez Hidalgo, Wendy, Crecimiento económico mella poco en el subempleo, La Prensa (Ni.), Aug. 8, 2017.

<sup>19</sup> Alvarez Hidalgo, Wendy, Crecimiento económico mella poco en el subempleo, La Prensa (Ni.), Aug. 8, 2017.

<sup>20</sup> Safety & Security Messages, U.S. Embassy in Nicaragua, <https://ni.usembassy.gov/u-s-citizen-services/security-and-travel-information/> (last visited Oct. 19, 2017).

<sup>21</sup> The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2017, World Economic Forum, 2017.

<sup>22</sup> The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report 2017, World Economic Forum, 2017.